INEE Working Group on Education and Fragility

Consultative Workshop on Education and Fragility—Sarajevo

10-11 March 2011

Sarajevo, Bosnia-Herzegovina

<div align="center">

Main Points:
Consultative Workshop on Education and Fragility—Sarajevo

</div>

The Inter-Agency Network for Education in Emergencies (INEE) and the Open Society Foundations (OSF) co-hosted a two-day event on education in emergencies and fragile contexts on 10-11 March 2011. The event brought together education practitioners and policy makers from Bosnia-Herzegovina, Croatia, Macedonia, Montenegro and Serbia to share knowledge and tools on education in emergencies and to undertake critical analysis of the interface between education and fragility.

The second day of the event served as a Consultative Workshop on Education and Fragility during which participants explored education and fragility issues in the Western Balkans region. The workshop led participants through interactive sessions to explore the two-sided aspects of education in fragile contexts: how education has been impacted by aspects of fragility (including poor governance, violence, repression, corruption, inequality and exclusion), and how it can mitigate and prevent crisis.

The workshop used the framework developed and utilized at the East African regional workshop held in October 2010 and a country-focused workshop in South Sudan in February 2011. During the workshop, participants worked in teams to:
- Analyze their country contexts in terms of major developments over the last 10 years in the areas of security, governance, economics, society and the environment;
- Analyze the role of education – positive or negative – in those major developments; and
- Develop strategies for maximizing the impact of education in fragile situations

The main points from the discussions are included by country below.

Bosnia-Herzegovina

Key developments:
- Significant demographic changes within society.
- Discriminatory practices still abundant in all aspects of society.
- Low level of trust amongst different social and ethnic groups.
- Maintenance of status quo has lead to a decrease in sense of belonging.
- Politicization of all areas of social life.
- High levels of youth unemployment and poverty.
- High levels of corruption.
- Large administrative apparatus gives the illusion of decentralization but the system is actually highly centralized.
- General sense of fear and insecurity, peace is seen as fragile and unsustainable.

Impacts of education on key developments:
- Bosnia has much in common with the other regions' challenges, and there is a strong belief that links with education systems in the Balkan region are important and should be strengthened.
- Croatia and Serbia are influential in regards to policies and curriculum.
- Lack of investment and action in education by the state for several years.
- Education is a habitual system that is burdened by the past.
- Representatives are trying to identify the path that will lead to 'real' and positive change. They know what they don't want, but are still trying to identify good models to replicate in order to create real positive and lasting change.
- No clear model or vision for education to deal with social problems.
- Education is not just schooling, it is a reflection of, and a cause of, many aspects of life in society.
- There are Framework laws for primary and secondary education and, more recently, higher education. The Framework law is an attempt to reform the education system and to support the harmonization of E.U. principles within the system.
- NGO led activities have short and long term consequences, both positive and negative.
- There needs to be stronger links between the NGO sector and with education on a state level.
- A long-term vision and outlook is needed.

- The issue of decentralization is complex and does not curb ethnic divisions
- School curricula and programs often end up exacerbating rural/urban divides
- Violence is on the rise, and thus repressive measures are on the rise. There is no investment in preventative measures.
- Social distancing lends itself to a cycle where children are not only the victims of discrimination, but often become discriminators themselves, adopting the value system around them.
- There is little to no teacher support.
- Informal education is often neglected and does not assess students and teachers. There is no lifelong learning, assistance or strategies to do such.

Croatia

Key developments:
- Social cohesion, rather than peace is the overall goal, as peace has already been achieved.
- Joined NATO in 2009.
- The E.U accession process, which started in 2005, remains ongoing.
- The strength of civil society has recently improved, but the financial recession has resulted in general unrest and tension, as well as low productivity in the public sector.
- Loans have helped with economic growth, alongside growth in trade and tourism.
- Stable currency.
- 17.6% unemployment rate in 2010.
- Corruption and decentralization are on the rise.
- Strong disparities between the rich and poor.
- No harmonization of government strategies.

Impacts of education on key developments:

Positive:
- Public primary and secondary schools are free of charge.
- New framework curriculum helps promote goals of social cohesion. The framework, which is inclusive and outcomes-based includes a focus on civil education, environmental standards, conflict resolution and has been passed in legislation. The framework has yet to be implemented.
- Recent student protests calling for 'democratic social change' are seen as a positive force for change.
- Approximately 80 per cent of students are now paying students.

Negative:
- Pre-school is not compulsory
- Kindergarten is not free, this doesn't contribute to 'Education for All' goals.
- Financial constraints have resulted in low teacher salaries and lack of teacher career opportunities, making it an undesirable career choice for young people.
- No systematic effort except for goodwill and various civil society efforts.
- Decrease in quality of higher education system; costly for students and not linked to labor force needs.
- Religious education is not contributing to social cohesion, with severe catholic and orthodox divisions.
- Failure to understand that education in religion and religious education are two different things.
- Segregation in schools – Serbs using schools in the morning, Croats in the afternoon, while Roma children are taught separately and aren't integrated at all.
- Lack of political will and trade union opposition regarding implementation of the 'framework' curriculum.

Macedonia

Key developments:
- Social unrest has persisted in the country for past ten years due to ethnic conflict in 2001.

- After the conflict there were changes to the constitution – fulfilled NATO criteria and increased national security.
- Some decrease in corruption.
- High levels of unemployment – up to 30% of people live below poverty line.
- Social assistance is in place to assist the vulnerable, to ensure integration and help with education.
- Macedonia is moving towards integration with the E.U.
- Decentralization of education began in 2004.
- Introduction of a program for integrated education that mandated equal participation of ethnic groups.
- An adult education center was opened for first time.
- Engagement of the state apparatus on education goals is high.

Impacts of education on key developments:

- 22-24,000 students.
- Process of decentralization since 2005 – municipalities struggled due to a lack of capacity and manpower, some regions have more money than others.
- Politicization at the local level has allowed mayors to hire and fire principals and teaching staff, and to make education policy.
- Fiscally, education is now solely financed on the local level. An advantage of this has been an increase in community engagement.
- Legislative changes don't accurately reflect the on-the-ground realities.
- There is still a lack of implementation of legislation – becomes a cycle of frequent changes in law that aren't implemented, hence law is changed again, then not implemented, and so on.
- There are still no clear-cut procedures to guide the process between legislating and implementing new policies and laws.

Positive:
- Nine years of primary education is regulated by law, and has led to an overall increase in attendance figures.
- Introduction of a new law on vocational secondary education.
- Bologna process – experiencing the same hurdles of implementation as other countries.
- Seeking compliance with E.U. standards including post-secondary assessments on state level.
- Secondary education is free for all families that receive social security. Transport and boarding are offered, plus a cash grant of about 20 Euros per child. Charges can be brought for non-compliance.
- Joint/integrated classes for two communities have been provided.
- Schools undertaking these new programmes have been supplied with the best equipment, ideal conditions, working aids, modern education processes etc. There is huge interest in the inclusive schools from parents and family groups.
- Students can choose which school they'd like to attend, a move which has not resulted in any controversy or further separation.
- Municipalities became responsible for education and local communities could participate more fully in the process
- New integration programmes which have been successful and boosted integration have been supported by the Norwegian Council and the International Dialogue Center. A successful model for other countries to follow.
- Macedonia employs the Scottish model where every school is evaluated every three years, including all its functions.

Negative:
- Government promotes integration, inclusivity in a programme that still hasn't developed into overall actions. The programme is also a big financial burden on the ministry.
- Municipalities didn't have the required structure, finance, or expertise in education.
- Differences of financial power in municipalities led to differences in quality of education.
- Local mayors had the power over schools, selection of teachers, etc.
- Localized education policies led to specialized curricula, and vocational programs are also controlled.

Montenegro

Key developments:
- Roma children were outside the system for a long time, but integration started in 2000. There is a strong need to further facilitate the integration of Roma children from Kosovo.
- NGO have some influence on government but there haven't been any big changes (same government has been in power for the last 20 years).
- Status of foreign nationals is in question.
- Numerous workers' protests.
- Many people obtain degrees, but there's no quality assurance.
- Surveys show that ethnic distancing is growing.
- High drop-out rate for girls
- Need to harmonize legislation and practice (e.g. the signed convention on education standards).
- The labor market structure has changed due to privatization.
- Poor environmental protection and systems.
- There is no control over religious media (of any religious group).

Impacts of education on key developments:

Positive:
- Harmonization with E.U. standards has led to increased training and assessment programs.
- The seminars and trainings have been mostly led by NGOs.
- Employment bureaus have begun both vertical and horizontal education programs.
- Acknowledgement of the need for integration and equality. There are attempts to bring peer groups together and promote community service.
- Creation of private schools and universities that promise job opportunities upon completion.
- School programming – introduction of an elective civil education course includes E.U. integration, citizen rights and good quality texts. The course has been successful but needs to maintain a certain level of enrolments (24) to survive as an elective.
- "Healthy Lifestyles" elective course is also popular. This is a multi-sectoral course that was instilled by the NGO sector (health and education).
- The media in Montenegro has a very strong influence, it shapes education and its actors from the bottom-up.
- There is an active civil society but splintered communities that is reflected in the media-Catholic (representing the Croatian minority in Montenegro), Orthodox, and Islamic, all vying for power and influence.

Negative:
- Unequal representation in government even after promises of greater equality during referendum for independence and a law to protect national minorities. In 2007, Albanians undergoing criminal trials were not able to speak their native language in court.
- The education system promotes equality as a principle but lacks implementation.
- Ethnic distancing is a growing problem after Serbia and Montenegro separated in 2003.
- Economic gap between rich and poor is growing.
- NGOs are the key facilitators of change, consistently taking on the burden of what the state should be doing.
- There is a lack of guidance on the implementation of E.U. documents and a lack of technical assistance at school level.
- There is a general feeling that state funding isn't being used for things of importance. There is a strong need for better systems, staff development programs, and equipment in schools.
- There is no system of getting feedback from the education sector to the state. Education is not viewed as an agent of change or as a particularly democratic process.
- Process of privatization has been undertaken but the education system is not well adjusted to changes in the labor market, i.e. certain vocations have been told to change their education profile because the market can't offer jobs for their particular profession.

- The first private university that opened was perceived as being elitist, exacerbating the gap between the rich and poor and putting public university students at a disadvantage.
- There is little to no attention paid to assessment and delivery within the private schools.
- One private secondary school (that was geographically isolated) recently closed due to lack of student enrolments. Students did not want to be separated from their peers and craved social mobility. Famously, the son of the Premier left the private school for his old public school.
- The business sector does not 'reach out' to young people or offer recruitment/employment programs.
- Under-development of career guidance is a problem in times of labor market change.
- There is a strong need for lifelong learning processes and/or programs, particularly ones run by the State.
- Religion and religious groups still play a very large part in education and education policy. There is an interesting dynamic between religion and media as a force over education.
- History of religions is a state-moderated school subject yet there is no control or assessment of religious teaching outside of state schools. This system verges on indoctrination, religious equality is undermined.
- There is no sanctions or limits to religious representatives despite Montenegro being a 'secular' country.
- Environmental awareness – on paper and not in practice yet, e.g. children are taught how to recycle but there is no recycling system for them to use these new skills.
- Overall, there is a discontinuity between teaching and practice.
- Issues regarding language have led to discrimination in classes, allowing education to feed into discrimination. This has particularly affected Roma and Albanian children.
- Only mono-ethnic and national projects get funded, not ones that cater to multi-ethnic subjects, another example of education fueling segregation.

Serbia

Key developments:
- The influence of Mafia and 'football gang' mentality has increased national violence.
- Frequent changes of government, legislation, and of overall state planning and direction has lead to an apathy among voters.
- Young people are confused by political dealings (politicization of education) and what appears to be colluding between politicians.
- Despite robust legislation on education, a huge gap between law and practice still exists.
- New adult education programs are in force.
- Privatization, but is considered 'bad' and poorly done.
- High unemployment rate, lack of opportunities for young people.
- Strikes of education and health workers are common.
- Skills training needs to be streamlined to livelihoods and availability.

Impacts of education on key developments:

Positive
- Constitution guarantees free education for all, free textbooks are also currently being trialed.
- Schools without violence for a number of years, inclusive education is being systematically implemented
- There's now teacher training on prevention of violence.
- Regional history books have been developed by OSCE for the Balkans that showcase a variety of perspectives on Balkan history. These books have been supported by the education ministries in Croatia and Bosnia but are not an 'official' part of the curriculum. Individual teachers have the choice to use them if they wish.
- A "second chance" project is underway that offers education for dropouts or for those who never enrolled. These students will receive skills training that is coordinated with and informed by the labor bureau.

Negative:
- Overall, education system does not respond to labor market needs.
- The quality of education in private universities is under question, there's a lack of functional literacy.

- Nationalist leanings and stereotypes still exist in the school curriculum.
- Insufficient investment in implementation of new laws and policies.
- Frequent strikes of teaching staff hinders progress.
- OSCE textbooks are not an official part of the curriculum. Alternative, realistic overview of historical events is still needed in schools.
- Education law is not being fully implemented due to lack of finances.
- There are not enough pilot projects, so good aspects of the education law are not being implemented, recorded or shared widely.

SESSION 3

Cross-country teams discussed possible solutions to the above challenges. The following is a summary of their discussions.

Team 1: Education and the Labor Market
- Labor market is oversaturated and unemployment rate amongst youth, ethnic groups, women, etc is quite high.
- There is a lack of coordination between the labor market and education system.
- There is a need for continuous assessment and analysis of labor trends and data in order to obtain more information on occupational trends and availabilities, educational profiles, and growing industries.
- In Montenegro there is the problem of importing labor – mainly labor from Serbia, Bosnia-Herzegovina, and Macedonia and particularly in the field of construction.
- Secondary vocational schools are dated and out of sync with current industry needs. Better, more responsive models are required.
- A recent program financed by Coca Cola and Career team that involved secondary school graduates working for three months during tourist season is a good model for 'work tourism' or seasonal work.
- Seasonal work programs meet the needs of the labor market and can potentially be partnered with state agencies, NGOs, media, other businesses for a wider scope and greater opportunities.
- One option is for the state to make employers obliged to provide ongoing training and professional learning.
- Small grants/loans programs exist, but there are often no further resources or support provided.
- Mentors should be recruited to provide technical support to loan recipients (e.g. for small rural farmers).
- Programs of pre-qualification need to verify needs for particular vocations.

Team 2: Segregated Education
- In Bosnia-Herzegovina and Croatia segregation continues.
- Money brings people together so there needs to be both investments and political will to effect change, especially in Bosnia-Herzegovina. All sectors need to be on board.
- The readiness of local communities is key – the civil society must be the driving force of change, along with local government participation and parental support.
- There is a common curriculum for all, but this should be more multicultural, include democratic process, and should involve parents.
- Less focus on textbook policies and more focus on extracurricular activities that promote engagement is needed.
- Macedonia has good multi-cultural curricula and successful examples of in-class assistants who help facilitate in the classroom and in the community.
- In-class assistants can help curb segregation, break down language barriers, and have been able to facilitate between Roma and overall community.

Team 3: Religious Education
- Religious education is a pronounced problem in the whole region.
- Leads to greater segregation in schools and in society.
- Model of how Macedonia resolved this issue has traction, could possibly be adapted by other countries in the region.
- Religious education will be in schools but in a given context.
- The role of the education ministries in designing religious education and training teachers needs to expanded.
- How many classes of religious education are and at what age level is important to -often it is 2 times per week in secondary school.
- There has to be respect for the right of choice and of religious freedoms. This needs to be cultivated within society and particularly with parents.

Team 4: Education and the Environment
- Raising awareness of environmental protection via education programs.
- However what is needed is education for sustainable development, which is not the same as ecology or environmental awareness.
- Require new laws, but these must also connect with business and media groups in order to strengthen lobbying and advocacy.

- Implementation guides need to accompany policies and law.
- Education is not 'just schooling', intergenerational learning is key.
- Enhancing inter-sectoral cooperation is necessary as currently there is weak regional cooperation in regard to natural resources.
- Secure, long-term funding is critical.

INEE Regional Tools Launch and Consultative Workshop on Education and Fragility
Sarajevo, Bosnia-Herzegovina
Hotel Holiday Inn ~ 10-11 March 2011
Agenda

DAY 1   THURSDAY 10 MARCH

08:30—9:00	**Registration** **Hall Neretva**
9:00—9:30	**Welcome, opening remarks** *Dobrila Govedarica, Open Society Fund BH, Executive Director* *Ian Macpherson, OSF Education Support Programme, Deputy Director*
9:30—10:00	**Overview of Education in Emergencies in the Western Balkans** *Zagorka Aksentijevic, Group 484, Serbia* *Ivona Celebicic, proMENTE Social Research, BH*
10:00—11:00	**Introduction to the INEE Tools** *Tzvetomira Laub, INEE* *Kerstin Tebbe, INEE* *Question & Answer/Plenary Discussion*
11:00—11:15	*Break*
11:15—12:00	**INEE Tools: Parallel Learning Sessions** 1) INEE Minimum Standards for Education Location: Hall Neretva Facilitator: Tzvetomira Laub, INEE 2) INEE Reference Guide on External Education Financing Location: Hall Pliva Facilitator: Kerstin Tebbe, INEE
12:00—13:30	*Lunch*
13:30—14:10	**INEE Tools: Parallel Learning Sessions** 1) INEE Guidance Notes on Teaching and Learning Location: Hall Neretva Facilitator: Tzvetomira Laub, INEE 2) INEE Pocket Guide to Gender Location: Hall Pliva

	Facilitator: Kerstin Tebbe, INEE
15:10—15:30	*Break*
15:30—16:30	**Introduction to Education and Fragility: Research and Approaches** **Hall Neretva** Presentation followed by plenary discussion
16:30—17:00	**Getting Started: Consultative Workshop on Education and Fragility** **Hall Neretva** Overview of the purpose and objectives, activities of the Day 2 workshop
20.00	***Group Dinner, Restaurant Vinoteka***

<u>**DAY 2   FRIDAY 11 MARCH**</u>

08:30—9:00	**Intro for Day 2** **Hall Neretva**
09:00—10:00	**Session 1: The context of education – developing** **country overviews** Participants will work in country teams to identify major developments in their countries over the last 10 years and explore how those developments have impacted education. Developments can be classified in the areas of security, governance, economics, social and environment and will be presented in the subsequent session.
10:00—10:30	**Gallery walk of country overviews**
10:30—11:00	*Break*
11:00—12:00	**Session 2: Analyzing education's positive and negative role** Participants will work in country teams to identify the ways in which education has played a role, negatively or positively, in the key developments identified in Session 1.
12:00—13:30	*Lunch*
13:30—14:30	**Plenary discussion: Education's positive and negative roles**
14:30—15:30	**Session 3: Strategies for maximizing the positive impact of education in fragile situations** Participants will work in mixed teams to discuss approaches for maximizing education's positive role.
15:30—15:45	*Break*
15:45—16:30	**Plenary discussion: Maximizing the positive impact of education in fragile situations**
16:30—17:00	**Discussion of next steps, wrap-up**