

**Minimum Standards applied to the evaluation of Coaching Classes for 12th grade refugee students,
1 December 2005 – 1 May 2006 (NO/PK/05/91)**

An example of how the RET has used *Minimum Standards for Education in Emergencies, Chronic Crises and Early Reconstruction* to evaluate project implementation and as a framework for discussion and planning.

In order to analyse to what extent the *Minimum Standards for Education in Emergencies, Chronic Crises and Early Reconstruction* are being attained in the projects implemented by the RET in Pakistan, we looked at the project Remedial teaching for 12th grade refugee students, implemented 1 December 2005 – 1 May 2006, with the support of the Government of Norway.. The table below was produced by the RET Pakistan Education Officer (Hilde Lemey) and reviewed by her counterpart at RET headquarters (Ann Avery). It has provided a useful framework for analysis, dialogue, and recommendations for the future.

Through this exercise, we discern that of the 6 standards, the RET is strongest in those that concern teaching and learning. We feel the need to improve project performance particularly in relation to those that concern policy and coordination.

In the table below, the notes in blue give information as to how the implementation met the standards.

Minimum Standards	Indicators used to evaluate the project:
Community Participation	
Standard 1: Participation	
Standard 2: Resources	Programming was designed to maximise the use of local skills and capacities
Analysis:	
Standard 1: Initial	Assessment - The assessment identified priority educational needs and activities, meeting with the Ministry of Higher Education in Kabul in December 2003 . .
Standard 2: Response Strategy	Information collected from the initial assessment was updated with new data that inform ongoing programme development: The lessons learned from the first Coaching Classes project, implemented in the summer of 2004, were heeded during the elaboration and implementation of the current project. For example We attached more attention to the elaboration of syllabi for the courses by a core group of teachers and the necessary training of teachers.

Minimum Standards	Indicators used to evaluate the project:
Standard 3: Monitoring	<p>Personnel were trained in data collection methodologies: See tasks of the two coordinators.</p> <p>Programme adjustments were made, when necessary, as a result of monitoring: See adaptation of the time schedule, changing the subjects,</p>
Standard 4: Evaluation	
Access and Learning Environment	
Standard 1: Equal access	No individual is denied access to education and learning opportunities because of discrimination. Sixty per cent of the beneficiaries were girls. There were no students with disabilities.
Standard 2: Protection and well-being	<p>Schools and other learning environments are located in close proximity to the population they serve: Because of our organising the classes in 15 locations, or centrally located schools, students from neighbouring schools were able to access the classes more easily and safely.</p> <p>Access routes to the learning environment are safe and secure for all: Student transport, especially for girls, was paid.</p>
Standard 3: Facilities	<p>Communities participate in the construction and maintenance of the learning environment: Three hundred USD per location was distributed for repair. Each student received his own chair. Besides, each location received \$250 to cover administrative expenses and utilities linked to the remedial courses The community members were helping renovating the classrooms.</p>
Teaching and learning:	
Standard 1: Curricula	<p>Learning content, materials and instruction are provided in languages of the learners and the teachers. The adapted syllabi for each subject were elaborated in Dari.</p> <p>Curricula respond to the current needs of the learners and promote future learning opportunities. The syllabi elaborated for the six subjects taught cover the main gaps in student knowledge and can be used as a valuable educational tool for the coming school years, making up for the lack of adequate textbooks. We will return to Kabul to present all the materials we developed. We plan to make a film of the science experiments for use by others in the future. The creation of the syllabi relates to the ideas mentioned in Chapter VI , "Learning and Teaching Strategies" of the new Afghan curriculum.</p>

Minimum Standards	Indicators used to evaluate the project:
Standard 2: Training	- Training corresponds to prioritised needs, objectives of education activities and learning content: Each teacher received training before the start of the project. Qualified trainers conduct the training courses. Experienced teachers, having more than 5 years of teaching experience, were conducting the lessons.
Standard 3: Instruction	Learners are provided with opportunities to be actively engaged in their own learning: Science kits were distributed to each location.
Standard 4: Assessment	Differentiated continuous assessment and evaluation methods are in place to assess. See the school monitoring reports.
Teachers and other Education Personnel	
Standard 1: Recruitment and selection	Clear and appropriate job descriptions are developed: see job description of the coordinator.
Standard 2: Conditions of work	The code of conduct is signed and followed by education personnel: Each teacher involved signed an agreement. Decent salaries were paid to teachers and headmasters.
Standard 3: Support and supervision	Staff performance appraisals are conducted: Letters of appreciation to the teaching staff were distributed.
Education policy and Coordination	
Standard 1: Policy formulation and enactment	The project resulted from the RET's cross-border needs assessment involving the Ministry of Higher Education in Kabul, drawing the RET's attention to the gaps in knowledge of the returnee students.
Standard 2: Planning and implementation	Emergency education programmes are planned and implemented in a manner that provides for their integration into longer-term development of the education sector. The project is aimed to facilitate the bridging of secondary to tertiary education.
Standard 3: Coordination	The Education Department of the Afghan Consulate in Peshawar and the Ministry of Higher Education in Kabul were regularly informed about the project. We will report the results of this second series of coaching classes and discuss the future possibilities with them. We have talked about possibilities of collaboration with Bamiyan university for a project there.